

**AREA PLAN COMMISSION OF TIPPECANOE COUNTY
MINUTES OF A PUBLIC HEARING**

DATE.....December 16, 2020
TIME.....6:00 P.M.
PLACE..... County Office Bldg.
20 N. 3rd Street
Lafayette, IN 47901

Due to the public health emergency, the meeting was held virtually. Members of the public may watch the livestream of the meeting at <https://www.facebook.com/TippecanoeCountyIndiana> or <https://www.youtube.com/channel/UCJleeA9ZQo9E11GdZTdjurQ/featured>

MEMBERS PRESENT

Vicki Pearl
Greg Jones
Carla Snodgrass
Larry Leverenz
Diana Luper
Michelle Dennis
Tracy Brown
Tom Murtaugh
Gary Schroeder
Jackson Bogan
Kathy Parker
Lisa Dullum
Perry Brown
Dr. Carl Griffin
Roland Winger

MEMBERS ABSENT

Jerry Reynolds
Jake Gray

STAFF PRESENT

Sallie Fahey
Ryan O’Gara
Larry Aukerman
Don Lamb
Chyna Lynch
Kathy Lind
Zach Williams, Atty.

The Area Plan Commission of Tippecanoe County Public Hearing was held virtually on the 16th day of December 2020 at 6:00 P.M., pursuant to notice given and agenda posted as provided by law.

President Jackson Bogan called the meeting to order. He thanked everyone involved in making this meeting possible. He asked that everyone mute their microphones until they wished to speak or vote.

Attorney, Zach Williams, called the roll to establish members present.

I. BRIEFING SESSION

None.

II. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Gary Schroeder moved to approve the minutes from the November 18, 2020 meeting. Greg Jones seconded and the motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

**III. NEW BUSINESS
PRIMARY APPROVAL EXTENSION REQUEST
ELLIOTT INDUSTRIAL PARK (S-2351):**

The owner, JIRO, LLC (represented by TBIRD Design Services), is requesting an 11th two-year extension of the conditional primary approval granted on January 17, 1996. The original

preliminary plat covers an 8-lot industrial subdivision on 17.446 acres, located at the southeast corner of Brady Lane and Concord Road, in Lafayette, Wea 3 (SE) 22-4.

Gary Schroeder moved to hear and approve the Request for a Belated Primary Approval Extension for ELLIOTT INDUSTRIAL PARK (S-2351). Greg Jones seconded.

Don Lamb presented the zoning map, plat, and aerial photos. He said the Elliott Industrial Subdivision was started 24 years ago and is located at the southeast corner of Brady and Concord. It is also the location of Henry Poor Lumber. The old proposal was for 8 lots and 3 of the lots have been recoded so far. The construction plans were approved in 2000. All utilities have been installed and accepted by the city. Staff recommended approval of the two-year extension contingent on the following conditions:

Conditions

1. "No Vehicular Access" statements shall be platted along the Brady Lane and Concord Road right-of-way lines, as shown on the preliminary plat. These restrictions shall be included in the subdivision covenants as enforceable by the Area Plan Commission and irrevocable by the lot owners.
2. At the time of secondary approval, if there is a mortgage on this property, a release from the mortgage company must be obtained in order to dedicate the necessary right-of-way.
3. The sanitary sewer and water plans shall be approved by the City of Lafayette, as part of the construction plans.
4. The fire hydrants shall be approved by the "Wea" Township Fire Department. Plans for the actual placement of the hydrants shall be approved by the City in cooperation with the Fire Department, as part of the construction plans.
5. An Erosion and Sediment Control Plan meeting the requirements of 327 I.A.C. 15-5 shall be submitted to both the Tippecanoe County Soil and Water Conservation District and the County Drainage Board. The Drainage Board must approve the storm water management plan, including the Erosion and Sediment Control Plan, in writing. The approval and plan must be incorporated in, and made a part of, the construction plans.
6. The purpose, ownership and maintenance of Outlot "A" shall be included in the subdivision covenants.
7. All existing easements, covenants or restrictions shall be shown on the final plat(s) and referenced with the corresponding recording information (Document Number and date recorded).
8. An overall utility coordinating sheet shall be included in the construction plans. This utility sheet shall be approved and signed-off by the nongovernment utility companies.
9. All required setbacks shall be shown on the final plat(s).
10. The Lafayette City corporation line must be shown on the final plat.
11. The Regulatory Flood Elevation and Boundary for the Elliott Ditch Flood Plain shall be described and shown on the final plat. The final plat must also include a certification of the areas of the plat that are at or above the Regulatory Flood Elevation (100 year flood elevation), as specified in the Unified Zoning Ordinance, Section 2.4.
12. The street addresses and County Auditor's Key Number shall be shown on the final plat.

Jackson Bogan asked if the petitioner or their representative wanted to make a presentation and if there were any documents to share through GoToMeeting.

Tim Balensiefer, 105 N 10th Street, Lafayette, IN 47901, representative for petitioner, said he agrees with staff's recommendation. The owner indicated that they are looking to finish this in 2021. He respectfully requested approval.

Jackson Bogan said we will have a one-minute pause for citizen comment. After the minute passed, he asked Ryan O'Gara if we received any citizen comments. There were none.

Zach Williams conducted a vote by roll call. The motion was approved 14 yes to 0 no.

Yes-Votes

Jackson Bogan
 Lisa Dullum
 Diana Luper
 Gary Schroeder
 Vicki Pearl
 Kathy Parker
 Tom Murtaugh
 Carla Snodgrass
 Greg Jones
 Perry Brown
 Tracy Brown
 Larry Leverenz
 Michelle Dennis
 Roland Winger

No-Votes

Gary Schroeder moved to continue **S-4963 CASA BELLA MINOR SUBDIVISION (minor-sketch)** to the January 6th, 2020 Executive Committee meeting. Greg Jones seconded and the motion carried by unanimous voice vote.

IV. ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS
The 2020 Tippecanoe County Student Rental Report

Ryan O’Gara said this was going to be the year that we were not going to do the survey with the landlords because we have been trying to do that every other year. This has been an off year but there is good news to report in this. Because of the census this year, there are real numbers to report as opposed to projections. The projections have been slow and steady in terms of population growth. However, Purdue’s population growth has been dramatic. This is going to put development pressure on this area and there are no signs of this abating. The effects of the pandemic are still being felt. Purdue has opened online learning and if that catches on, that may have a chilling effect on future rental development. Next year, we are going to try to isolate that group and see how much of the student body is present in the community. Purdue housing is starting to flatline. They recently built 1,300 off campus beds recently and they are now up to 15,000 bed spaces on and off campus. This puts added pressure on the private sector as they make moves to fulfill the potential growing demand. We try to capture the student group that is within the Parking Permit C Boundary. Students within that boundary cannot get a commuter permit to park on campus. We did an analysis of those that are commuting that live outside of the boundary by looking at the number of C Parking Permits issued to see where they are. We report on West Lafayette’s rental inspection program data. There were some increases last year with all the new units coming online in and around the Chauncey Village area.

The main part of the report uses HUD data. He presented a map of the area and the census tracts that are included in the analysis. This is broken into West Lafayette including areas outside of the city limits and the Lafayette area. There is stability on the West Lafayette side as well as some significant drops although the vacancy rate in 2016 was particularly high. These are averages of these years since there is quarterly information available. For the Lafayette area, it has been steady.

Carl Griffin joined the meeting at 6:15 pm.

He said we decided to add nuance to this year’s report by separating out what has been termed suburban and urban tracts. This determination was made on the map displayed with the dark blue areas as the core areas for West Lafayette and the dark yellow areas as the core areas for Lafayette. The Lafayette area roughly falls in line with the urban sewer boundary. The spread between urban vacancies are stable in the West Lafayette area in the core tracts. That speaks to a healthy market and that is a desirable place to be regardless of the condition of the unit. As for the suburban tracts, they are trending downward, but they were not high to begin with. This speaks to stability that even the outer areas in West Lafayette are desirable areas. The Lafayette core tracts have always been higher. The outer parts of Lafayette have always had a

lower vacancy rate than the inner tracts. This may have to do with units that need to be rehabilitated and are no longer desirable. There is room for investment and improvement in the older parts of Lafayette where there are vacancies.

In the general conclusion, we have made an assertion over the last couple of years to pause on major student rental development in and around campus in an abundance of caution to not overly saturate the market. What this data is showing is that even among the newer units in their first year of opening, and despite the pandemic, the vacancy rates are still low. This is the first wave of data that is supporting the notion that the pause could be eased off. However, this may change with the unclear results of the pandemic. We will keep an eye on it and make sure our policy statements are in alignment with any emerging trends. There is also occupancy data that we accumulated from West Lafayette landlords in a variety of densities. This data is broken down by complexes that are 100 units or more, mid-range density and lower density. The numbers are healthy but there is no way to verify these situations. This data reflects the fall 2020 numbers, so they reflect the new school year with the pandemic.

Lisa Dullum asked if there is a range in vacancy rates that we consider healthy or if we would be concerned if it were too low or too high.

Ryan O'Gara said we have not developed a methodology to establish ranges. Given the fluctuations and students coming and going, when the rate is 75% or greater it is pretty good. It would be interesting in representing the data in terms of a healthy vacancy rate.

Lisa Dullum said if the vacancy rate got too low, there would be a problem with people not being able to find affordable housing. This report doesn't speak to housing affordability.

Ryan O'Gara said this study is not specifically geared towards affordable housing. When there is an increase in vacancies in an area, that shows a saturation in units or undesirable units. Those vacancies could potentially become properties in distress. On the planning side of things, we scrutinize plan developments to look for affordability in desirable areas. We try to make sure there is a diverse mix of unit types. We have not reached the level where we are investigating the imposition of a formal affordable housing standard. In other places, there is a requirement that 10 of the units must be below market rate and are subsidized in some fashion. We have not achieved that level of unaffordability and there are opportunities in the community.

Sallie Fahey said staff used to look at vacancy rates and if it reached 10 percent, the market was likely ready for additional units. Gary may have some knowledge to bring into this discussion as well.

Gary Schroeder said what Ryan and Sallie said is on the mark. Even in what we call conventional rentals as opposed to student rentals, normal turnover would give that 7 to 10 percent vacancy. In student rentals, this is one month a year. He said he is not sure where the industry is today on appraisals but if someone puts in for a loan, they count 7 percent. When we get lower than 5 percent, it does not create opportunity of choices for people and prices go up. At the 10 percent range, the prices will be competitive. Tenants will hold out when they know there is a glut and wait for prices to drop. With enrollment up, it is a tight market for students. He said his houses are 100 percent occupied and rent did not need to be cut despite the pandemic.

Recognition of Dr. Carl Griffin's retirement from APC

Jackson Bogan said tonight, we get to wish Dr. Carl Griffin well with his retirement. The APC is losing quite an asset. Mayor John Dennis has a few words he would like to say as well.

John Dennis thanked everyone for letting him speak this evening. He asked Carl how he was doing.

Carl Griffin said he was well. He thanked Mayor Dennis for having confidence in him and letting him continue to be on the APC over the years. He said it has been a pleasure. He said we have had a lot of talented and committed folks serving on APC over the years. He said the only person more senior than him is Gary

Schroeder and he has taught him more than a thing or two over the years. He said he has enjoyed working with everyone.

John Dennis said it was an easy choice. Carl has been a valuable asset to our community and more specifically to the City of West Lafayette. It is going to be challenging to try to find someone to replace him that has the same understanding of business, development and growth with the same passion for neighborhoods, schools and the environment. These are traits that few individuals have. Carl has proven to be scholarly in his approach to how these boards operate. He said in his 13 years as mayor, Carl has always provided guidance on how to proceed especially when he was new. Carl has involved himself in some of the early development when the city had their first growth spurt about 8 years ago. He said he appreciates that as a mayor and as a citizen of West Lafayette. Carl has proven his passion for a community is more than just a job, it is a calling.

Jackson Bogan presented a virtual certificate to Carl for his service. He said this would be much better in person and he could shake his hand. He said he hopes Carl knows how much we all respect and appreciate all that he has done throughout his tenure. He wished him health and happiness in his retirement.

Carl Griffin thanked everyone for putting up with his questions and so forth over the years.

Gary Schroeder said it has been a pleasure to serve with Carl on the APC. He said we have been busy working through issues together and writing many ordinances together over the years. He said he appreciates Carl's community service. He said it has been fun and we will miss you.

Roland Winger thanked Carl. He said he served as Carl's vice president and they worked through a couple of challenging neighborhood plans together.

Sallie Fahey said from staff's perspective, we appreciated the compassion with which you approach this job and your often-sagacious questions. The real certificate will be in the mail.

V. APPROVAL OF THE JANUARY EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE AGENDA

No new subdivisions were filed this month.

VI. DIRECTOR'S REPORT

Sallie Fahey said with the positivity rate increasing all over the state, the County Commissioners and the Health Department have come with a great idea to implement. They asked department heads to divide their staff into two teams so for two weeks one team works in the office while the other works from home and then we switch. She said she divided our staff into teams that would include all areas of expertise so that in the office, all aspects of what we do can be covered for citizens that come to the office. She said this idea is brilliant. If a staff member on one team would test positive, we do not have to close the entire office, we just have to quarantine one team. The other team can come into the office and take over while that happens. This is a good idea with COVID being ramped up. This keeps us separated and at home where everyone is safe. On another note, Tim Stroshine got notice that he passed his PE on the first try. Anyone who knows or is a PE, knows that passing on the first try is a pretty big deal. We are happy for him.

VII. CITIZEN COMMENTS AND GRIEVANCES

Jackson Bogan said there will be a one-minute pause for citizen comment and or grievances. After the minute passed, he asked Ryan O'Gara if there had been any additional comments received. There were none.

Steve Clevenger thanked Carl for his time serving on the ABZA.

VIII. ADJOURNMENT

Carl Griffin moved to adjourn.

The meeting adjourned at 6:41 pm.

Respectfully Submitted,

Chyna R. Lynch
Recording Secretary

Reviewed By,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Sallie Fahey". The signature is written in black ink on a light-colored, slightly textured background.

Sallie Fahey